

## 中国农业大学国际发展研究中心

Research Center for International Development (RCID)

中国农业大学国际发展研究中心(RCID)来源于1988年建立的中国联邦德国综合农业发展中心(CIAD),该中心属于联邦德国和中国的双边发展合作项目之一,其后又成为国际农村发展中心。在上世纪90年代期间,大批中心的工作人员赴德国、荷兰、英国、美国、法国等发达国家学习发展研究,陆续回国后,使得中心成为了我国第一所发展人才比较集中的、国际化的发展实践机构。期间,中心的研究人员为世界银行、亚洲开发银行、联合国发展系统,各双边发展援助机构,以及国际NGO组织等提供了非常重要的技术服务,使中心成为了国内外知名的国际发展咨询的研究机构。从上世纪90年代末期开始,中心的业务开始由国际发展咨询逐步扩展为国际发展教育和发展研究,其发展教育的功能演化成为了我国第一所农村发展学院,而后成为了今天的人文与发展学院。其国际发展的研究工作延续成为今天的国际发展研究中心的职能。基于长期从事发展实践和发展教育的经验,特别是对国际发展合作体系、运作模式、项目计划和监测评价等方面长期的实践,更为重要的是,随着中国的不断发展和壮大,国际发展研究更加成为中国国际发展研究中重要的战略组成部分,中国农业大学国际发展研究中心凭借其特有的实力,致力于在中国对外发展合作的方式、政策,中国的非洲发展研究,以及中国的发展中国家发展研究、国际发展研究等方面做出新的贡献。

编辑:王妍蕾

地址:北京市海淀区清华东路17号中国农业大学(东校区)民主楼

邮编:100083

电话:62737745

传真:62737725

E-mail:rcid@cau.edu.cn

下载地址: <http://cohd.cau.edu.cn/rcid/>

内部资料,仅供参考,请勿引用

本书获得了英国国际发展部(DFID)所资助的“国际发展研究网络:支持中国的国际发展研究”项目的支持。

2013年11月  
第10期

2013年11月第5期  
(总第10期)



国际发展研究网络

International Development Research Network (CIDRN)



中国农业大学国际发展研究中心

Research Center for International Development (RCID), China Agriculture University

# 国际发展研究进展

CURRENT ISSUES ON

INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT



## China's Foreign Aid: History, Current Situation and Challenges

Tang Lixia, Ma Jiewen, Li Xiaoyun

## 中国的对外援助:历史、现状和挑战

马洁文,唐丽霞,李小云

## 全球国际发展研究机构介绍

A Brief Introduction for CGD



## 编者按

自二战以来，作为一种制度创新，国际发展正日益成为与国际经济与贸易、国际政治与安全并驾齐驱的一个重要概念，成为全球治理架构的重要组成部分。它以国际发展干预为载体，从概念、政策到手段，从制度、机构到人员，已形成一套制度化的系统框架。随着中国在国际上影响力的逐日扩增，及其在对外交流与合作理念、方式上的独特性，西方发达国家不断给中国施加压力，希望将中国纳入现行的、以西方发达国家为主体的国际发展援助体系。面对上述日趋复杂的国际形势，如何更好地为国家的对外政策提供建议，同时提高中国学者在国际舞台上的对话能力和影响力，是当今中国国际发展研究所面临的一个迫切的现实问题。

需要指出的是，在历经六十多年的摸索之后，以西方为主导的国际发展研究在实践中积累了丰厚的经验，也有许多值得反思的失败案例，并形成一系列制度化的框架，这些经验、教训及框架成为我们进一步开展国际发展研究中不可忽视的资源。中国农业大学**国际发展研究中心**长期致力于发展研究，从20世纪80年代的国际发展咨询，90年代的发展研究与教育，一直到进入新世纪后设立的中国第一个国际发展教育项目，我们创立了国内第一个、也是迄今唯一一个系统的从本科到博士，从针对国内学生到涵盖国际学生的国际发展研究的教育、研究、与咨询体系。在这个过程中，我们一方面尝试结合中国的发展实践探索具有中国视角的国际发展研究途径，另一方面，我们与国际发展研究学界保持密切的对话和沟通，积极参与国际发展框架内前沿的相关讨论。

我们的国际发展研究从基本资料的收集开始，近期主要集中介绍以发达国家为主导的国际发展援助委员会在不同阶段所通过的三个宣言，作为国际发展规范、规则和共同目标的一部分，它们体现了发达国家在开展国际发展集体行动中的一种集体性程序。为进一步加深对这些基本概念、基本数据和基本观点的理解，我们也将附上国际著名专家在相关方面的前沿性论文。通过对这些基本概念与管理体的梳理开始，我们逐步呈现国际发展框架下以西方发达国家为主导的国际发展话语体系，并以内部资料的形式介绍给大家，供决策者、学者和相关机构参考。

编者

2013年11月15日

# 目 录

<b>China's Foreign Aid: History, Current Situation and Challenges</b> .....	1
I. History and Strategic Evolution of China's Foreign Aid.....	2
II China's foreign aid funds, scale, method, key areas and direction .....	4
III China's foreign aid agencies and management.....	8
IV. Challenges for China's foreign aid .....	10
References.....	12
<b>中国的对外援助：历史、现状和挑战</b> .....	15
一、中国对外援助的历史和战略演变 .....	15
二、中国对外援助的资金、规模、方式、重点领域与流向 .....	17
三、中国对外援助的机构与管理.....	20
四、中国对外援助面临的挑战.....	21
参考文献 .....	22
<b>全球国际发展研究机构介绍</b> .....	24



# China's Foreign Aid: History, Current Situation and Challenges

Tang Lixia   Ma Jiewen   Li Xiaoyun

**Abstract:** Over the years, while focusing on its own development, China has been providing aid within its capacity to other developing countries with economic difficulties, and fulfilling its due international obligations. This paper attempts to make a systematic introduction and review of China's foreign aid from an historical and policy perspective, including scale, methods, fieldwork, and management experiences as practical challenges. As an important external field of China's own development experience, China's foreign aid has actively supported the political independence, economic development and social progress of developing countries, made a significant contribution to the realization of China's international strategic objectives in different periods and set a good example for "South-South cooperation". It is a useful supplement to the traditional Western aid architecture. Meanwhile, there is still the need to enhance the level of intellectual debate around China's foreign aid policies, to continue to make innovations to the foreign aid mode, to optimize the assistance structure, and actively engage in effective dialogue with Western countries to cope with increasingly severe international challenges.

**Key words:** China's foreign aid, South-South Cooperation, Mutual benefit,

In 1950, China provided material assistance to Vietnam and the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, opening the prelude of China's foreign aid. Since then, while focusing on its own development, China has continuously always been providing aid to other developing countries. From political and diplomatic purpose-driven unilateral aid to the mutually beneficial economic cooperation, China's foreign aid modalities established under the framework of South-South Cooperation are significantly different from traditional main aid modalities of Western countries' main aid modalities (Wang & Ozanne, 2010). Various forms of funding, multi-field coverage, a variety of aid modalities and a three-dimensional full range of aid management constitute the aid mode with Chinese characteristics. China's foreign aid projects have received widespread recognition and praise from the recipient countries, becoming a useful supplement to the traditional aid architecture (Li, 2013). This paper attempts to makes a systematic introduction and review of China's foreign aid system and to contributes respond to the international discussion on China's foreign aid.



## I. History and Strategic Evolution of China's Foreign Aid

When talking about China in the field of foreign aid, the international community often uses the term "emerging donor" to show that China is a "rising star" in the field of foreign aid (Woods, 2008; McCormick, 2008). In fact, however, China started its foreign aid to other developing countries almost at the same time as the Western countries (Li, 2013). Since it provided material assistance to the Democratic People's Republic of Korea and Vietnam in the 1950s, China has continued its foreign aid work for more than six decades. According to the characteristics of the development aid and the subsequent changes, the history of China's foreign aid can be roughly divided into three stages.

The first stage is the period from the founding of New China to the reform and opening up, i.e. the start-up stage of China's foreign aid. After the Asian-African Conference held in Bandung in 1955, the objects of China's foreign aid extended from neighboring countries to other developing countries, especially to Africa, for which China mainly provided economic and technical assistance and military aid. The construction of Tanzania-Zambia Railway became a landmark event in China's foreign aid. Although the Chinese government announced the Eight Principles for Economic Aid and Technical Assistance to Other Countries with "equality and mutual benefit, without any attached conditions" as the core principles in 1964, the policy at this stage was still at the exploratory stage, being mainly manifested by prominent unidirectional features. China seldom received any aid from other countries and its foreign aid was provided mainly for political and diplomatic interests (Zhang, 2009). The aid decision-making put great emphasis on ideological factors, not taking into account such factors as economic feasibility, so the aid scale expanded sharply and the aid fund amount exceeded China's economic capacity (Li, 2013). From 1971 to 1978, China provided foreign aid of 29.66 billion Yuan to a total of 68 recipient countries, and this figure rose to 5.58 billion Yuan in 1973 accounting for 7.2% of China's fiscal expenditure, exceeding the proportion of foreign economic aid of the world's most developed and richest countries (Zhang, 2009).

The second stage is the period from late 1980s to mid-1990s, i.e. the Adjustment Stage of China's foreign aid. In this stage, China highlighted the basic principle of "equality", and the economic significance of foreign aid went beyond the demands of political interests. It put more emphasis on improving the economic efficiency and long-term effects of aid projects, striving to form a mutually beneficial win-win situation for mutual development with developing countries. Meanwhile, with the transformation of domestic planned economy to a socialist market economic system, the aid quality, efficiency and sustainability and other economic rationality factors were covered by the aid decision-making system. On the other hand, based on China's economic strength and actual situation, "remaining realistic while striving for the best" became the main guiding spirit for foreign aid in this stage. China did not significantly increase the amount of





foreign aid and the foreign aid spending only accounted for 0.09% of the GNP. China was no longer a single donor, but had the double identity of "donor - recipient country" and began to accept assistance from international organizations and developed countries.

After the mid-1990s, with the enhancement of China's economic strength and the formation of its diplomatic strategy emphasizing "mutually beneficial cooperation and common development", as a non-traditional donor, China gradually attracted international attention and China's foreign aid thus entered into the third stage of comprehensive advancement. First of all, at this stage, China's foreign aid content and methods became diverse and as for the aid channels, China attached increasing importance to strengthening the collective consultation with recipient countries. The specific aid modalities included eight methods developed in various stages. Secondly, aid funds showed a linear upward trend, and the average annual growth rate of foreign aid from 2004 to 2009 was 29.4%. On the whole institutionalization and standardization became the focus of China's foreign aid work in this period. The institutionalized Forum on China-Africa Cooperation has become a primary mechanism for China to provide economic and technical assistance to Africa, and a series of action plans developed at the forum have become the program guidelines for China's assistance to Africa.

Table 1: Three phases of Chinese Foreign Aid, 1953-2012

Phase	Year	Foreign Aid (100 Million)	Total Financial Expenditure (100 Million)	Percentage of foreign aid in foreign expenditure	GNP (100 Million)	Percentage of foreign aid in GNP
I	1953-1978	18.49	536.34	3.45%	1869.77	0.99%
II	1979-2000	20.01	4740.47	0.42%	32901.32	0.06%
III	2001-2012	99.95	56829.48	0.18%	269368.76	0.04%

Source: Chinese Statistics Year Book (various years), China Statistics Press

In 2011, China published the first "White Paper on Foreign Aid", marking the development of China's foreign aid policy towards openness and transparency. As a result, China's foreign aid system with the features of the three-dimensional and integrated features of China's foreign aid system becomes increasingly prominent and is becoming an integral part of Chinese symbols. In addition, China began to provide foreign aid within the framework and system of the international community, actively participating in the UN High-level Conference on the Millennium Development Goals and delivering aid commitments to developing countries. It gradually diluted its identity as a recipient country. A growing number of bilateral and multilateral development agencies have changed their unidirectional aid relationship with China to a more extensive cooperative arrangement.



## II China's foreign aid funds, scale, method, key areas and direction

### 1. Funds and Scale of Aid

Financial resources provided by China for foreign aid mainly fall into three types: aid grants, interest-free loans and concessional loans. Grants are mainly used to help recipient countries to build hospitals, schools and low-cost houses, and support well-digging or water-supply projects, and other medium and small projects for social welfare. Interest-free loans are mainly used to help recipient countries to construct public facilities and launch projects to improve people's livelihood. The tenure of such loans is usually 20 years, including five years of use, five years of grace and ten years of repayment. Concessional loans are mainly used to help recipient countries to undertake productive projects generating both economic and social benefits and large and medium-sized infrastructure projects, or to provide complete plant, mechanical and electrical products, technical services and other materials. At present, the annual interest rate of China's concessional loans is between 2% and 3%, and the period of repayment is usually 15 to 20 years (including five to seven years of grace)(white paper, 2011)

The first two come from China's state finances, while concessional loans are provided by the Export-Import Bank of China as designated by the Chinese government (China's Foreign Aid, 2011). At present, the annual interest rate of China's concessional loans is between 2% and 3%, and the period of repayment is usually 15 to 20 years. In addition to the above mentioned types of funds, other foreign aid financial arrangements include preferential buyer's credit, China-Africa development funds and African SME development loans, etc. Compared to developed Western countries, in recent years, China has increased the proportion of concessional loans. In 2010 and 2011, China provided 63.36 Billion yuan of foreign aid funds, of which 23.92 Billion yuan was in grants, 9.7 billion Yuan was in interest-free loans and 29.74 billion Yuan was in concessional loans, respectively accounting for 37.75%, 15.31% and 46.94% of the total. At the same time, OECD-DAC countries provided 221.436 billion U.S. dollars, including grants of \$ 181.336 billion, accounting for 81.89% of the total, and concessional loans of 36.189 billion U.S. dollars, accounting for only 16.34% of the total.

**Table 2 The structure of foreign aid funds: China and DAC**

	Grant		Loan		Other	
	Amount	%	Amount	%	Amount	%
China (billion yuan)	23.92	37.75%	39.44	62.25%	-	-
DAC member (billion USD)	181.336	81.89%	36.189	16.34%	3.911	1.77%

Source: MOFCOM and <http://stats.oecd.org/index.aspx>



China does not report to the OECD-DAC its foreign aid data and its official statistical caliber for foreign aid is significantly different from that of DAC (Zhang, 2011). For example, debt relief and scholarships are not covered in the scope of China's official development assistance, but are included in the Western aid statistics. Another example, China's preferential loan assistance only calculates the interest subsidy to the Export-Import Bank of China, but DAC countries take into account the full amount of the preferential loan. In addition, China's foreign aid budget usually includes military assistance and the loans provided for foreign-aided joint ventures and cooperative projects (Brautigam, 2009), which clearly are not taken into account by the ODA. Therefore, the international community has become concerned about the scale of China's foreign aid and some scholars have made their own estimates. For example, some estimate that China's annual development assistance fund may have reached \$ 1.5-2 billion (Lancaster, 2007b). Seen from the perspective of scale, however, compared to the developed countries, the amount of China's aid is still relatively small (Liu, 2011).

In addition, the concern about the scale of China's foreign aid has also resulted from the change in the balance of two forces for international assistance. In accordance with the DAC (2012) statistics, in 2011, the total amount of ODA provided by all the DAC members dropped by 2.7% compared to that of 2010, and the net expenditure of other official capital flows also decreased by 50% compared to that in 2009. According to the DAC's forecasts, this downward trend will continue. Since 2000, however, the total amount of China's foreign aid funds has maintained rapid growth with the average annual growth rate from 2004 to 2009 being 29.4%. In 2012, the foreign aid fund announced by the Chinese government nearly tripled that of 2004. In addition, the concern about the scale of China's foreign aid is also a result of the high fulfillment rate of China's foreign assistance commitments. According to the OECD / DAC statistics, the DAC member countries' aid commitment fulfillment rate has remained at about 90% in recent years, but this figure in China exceeded 95% in accordance with the central expenditure budget and final budget implementation report of the Ministry of Finance of PRC, and even exceeded the budget in some years.

**Table 3 The aid commitment and disbursement: China and DAC members**

	2007	2008	2009	2010
DAC members	92.77%	86.63%	87.00%	90.25%
China	103.40%	97.70%	95.70%	102.40%

Source: China Years Statistics and <http://stats.oecd.org/index.aspx?>





From the perspective of aid modalities, China started foreign aid by providing goods and materials, which later increased to complete project aid, including technical cooperation, human resources development cooperation and foreign aid medical teams. today, these five conventional aid modalities still occupy an important position in China's foreign aid provision. Since the 1990s, China conducted a series of reforms to promote the diversification of forms of assistance, and gradually increased the aid modalities, such as emergency humanitarian aid, volunteer programs in foreign countries, and debt relief. It significantly increased efforts on debt relief. At the end of 2011, China had signed debt relief protocols with 50 countries from Africa, Asia, Latin America, the Caribbean and Oceania, cancelling 391 mature debts totaling 27.56 billion Yuan.

The aid modalities of technical cooperation, human resources development cooperation, medical teams sent abroad, emergency humanitarian aid, volunteer programs in foreign countries and debt relief have all been adopted by OECD-DAC member countries and China. Project assistance has also been adopted by DAC members and China. The difference is that OECD -DAC members also provide two other aid modalities, namely budget support and program support, which both provide aid funds directly to the recipient countries / regions, with the funds being used by relevant departments of the recipient countries / regions. Such funds account for about 20% of the total aid budget. China's foreign aid, however, is mainly project assistance, and the aid projects are mainly constructed under the leadership of relevant Chinese companies (Brautigam, 2011). The aid funds are seldom transferred directly to the recipient countries / regions. That is the often quoted "turnkey" project. Although China's official documents never mention budgetary assistance and program assistance, prominent researchers have found that China actually provides limited budgetary aid. In 2004, for example, China provided \$ 3 million to Liberia to support the operation of power-sharing transitional government for 100 days; in 2006, China again provided the country with \$ 1.5 million of budget support. The Chinese government provided \$ 4 million to Guinea-Bissau for the payment of salaries of civil servants in 2004, provided \$ 1.5 million of international balance of payment support to Seychelles in 2007, and provided \$ 5 million in cash for Zimbabwe to pay wages in 2009 (Brautigam, 2012). The budgetary aid fund provided by the Chinese government in cash is sporadic and temporary rather than continuous and regular, and the purpose is very clear, and is quite different from the budgetary aid advocated by the United Kingdom and other countries.

### **3. Aid sectors**

According to official statistics, China's foreign aid covers agriculture, industry, economic infrastructure, public facilities, education, medical and health care as well as the newly proposed climate change assistance including cleaning energy as solar using and biogas. Although the announced development aid data do not divide the areas of



investment and detailed figures cannot be obtained, there is no doubt that China has put substantial aid resources into the field of infrastructure, which the Western countries are unwilling to invest in. It is however an urgent need in many developing countries (Lancaster, 2007). China's economic infrastructure support is very significant. Sixty One per cent of the preferential loans and 20% of the complete projects fall under economic infrastructure, while the Western developed countries invest little in this field, instead, they invest more in social public infrastructure and services. In 2010, the international funds invested in this field accounted for 30% of the total. China, however, invests little in the social and services field. Different from the Western countries, China attaches importance to assistance in the agricultural sector. China's agricultural aid modalities are diverse, including the construction of farms, agricultural technology demonstration centers, agricultural technology experimental stations and promotion stations, rehabilitation of farmland and water conservancy projects, provision of farm machinery, agro-processing equipment and related agricultural supplies, dispatch of agricultural technicians and senior agricultural experts to teach agricultural production techniques, provide agricultural development consulting services and organize training of agricultural personnel in recipient countries, etc. Agricultural assistance accounts for 4.7% of China's foreign preferential loans and 10.62% of the completed projects. The Western countries, however, provide relatively less aid in agriculture. In addition, China seldom provides development assistance to non-governmental organizations (NGOs), and no such information has been released so far. The Western countries, however, attach importance to the development of NGOs. From 2001 to 2007, they provided a total of \$ 11 million of aid funds to NGOs.

#### **4. Distribution of Aid**

From the perspective of geographical distribution, China's foreign aid shows the feature of comparatively even coverage. The recipients cover most developing countries in Asia, Africa, Latin America, the Caribbean, Oceania and Eastern Europe. As of the end of 2009, China had aided 161 countries and more than 30 international and regional organizations, including 123 developing countries that received aid from China on a regular basis. Of them, 30 are in Asia, 51 in Africa, 18 in Latin America and the Caribbean, 12 in Oceania and 12 in Eastern Europe. Asia and Africa, home to the largest population of poor people, received about 80% of China's foreign aid. Seen from the distribution of aid, there is no significant difference between the development assistance of China and Western countries. Seen from the geographical distribution, Africa and Asia are both key areas for the development assistance of China and Western countries. China pays more attention to aid to Africa and provides little aid to Europe. Comparatively speaking, China also attaches importance to aid to Latin America. Seen from the conditions for economic development of the recipient countries, China and the Western countries both target LDCs in providing



assistance. Comparatively speaking, China is more inclined to provide assistance to low-income countries, while the Western countries put more emphasis on aiding low-and middle-income countries.

**Table 4 Comparison of the proportion of foreign aid regions of China and DAC member countries in 2009**

	Europe	Africa	Latin America	Asia	Oceanica	Unspecified
China	0.30%	45.70%	12.70%	32.80%	4%	4.50%
DAC member countries	3.60%	31.62%	7.74%	32.64%	1.64%	22.76%
	LDCs	Low-income countries	Low-and middle-income countries	High-and middle-income countries	Other unspecified	
China	39.70%	23.40%	19.90%	11.00%	6%	
DAC member countries	31.39%	12.61%	20.79%	6.04%	29.19%	

Source: Ministry of Commerce: "China's Foreign Aid" (White Paper), 2011; OECD website: <http://stats.oecd.org/index.aspx?>

### III China's foreign aid agencies and management

With the development of external relations and foreign aid work, China has gradually set up and improved relevant agencies at all levels to manage its foreign aid and has constantly increased project management efforts (Ministry of Commerce, 2011). The characteristics can be summarized as centralized control and integrated management (Zhang, 2012). China has not set up a special and independent agency to facilitate foreign aid provisions like the developed countries in the West. In China, the aid fund has been increased quickly. China's foreign aid coordination is under the responsibility of the State Council. As China's highest administrative organ, however, the State Council can hardly conduct specific coordination and management of the foreign aid affairs, so the Ministry of Commerce plays a key role in foreign aid management and is responsible for the formulation of foreign aid policy, regulations, overall planning and annual plans, the review and approval of various kinds of aid projects and the whole process and management of project delivery (Ministry of Commerce, 2011), and needs to manage and coordinate nearly 90% of China's foreign aid capital. More than 20 ministries including Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Agriculture, and Ministry of Health are involved in the administration and implementation of foreign aid. The inter-ministry cooperation has become a key focus of foreign aid administration. China has set up a mechanism for a leading group for foreign aid, a mechanism for inter-ministry communication, and a mechanism of inter-ministry coordination to promote the facilitation of aid projects by the different ministries.



As the main governing body of foreign aid, the Ministry of Commerce specially created the Department of Aid to Foreign Countries (DAFC) to be specifically responsible for the management of foreign aid affairs. It also set up three institutions to support its aid work management, namely the Executive Bureau of International Economic Cooperation (EBIEC), China International Center for Economic & Technical Exchange and the Training Center of the Ministry of Commerce. The Executive Bureau of International Economic Cooperation is mainly responsible for the implementation and management of complete aid projects and technical cooperation projects. The China International Center for Economic & Technical Exchange is responsible for the implementation and management of foreign aid material projects. The Training Center under the Ministry of Commerce is mainly responsible for management and comprehensive coordination of foreign aid training projects. Under the supervision of the Department of Aid to Foreign Countries, the above three departments are responsible for the organization and management of aid projects in the course of project construction, including bidding and project implementation organization and management. Moreover, the MOH is responsible for overseas medical teams, the CCYI for overseas volunteers and MOF is in charge of emergent humanitarian aid. Concessional loans are under the management of the Export-Import Bank of China. The financial resource for all above aid modalities will be accounted for under the item of Foreign Aid Expenditure of the Central Budget System, except concessional loans. Furthermore, the departments of international cooperation under most ministries, such as MOA, MOST, MOE can also offer international aid from their own financial budget. The fragmented administrative system creates the problem of foreign aid statistics being inconsistent and administratively costly to maintain

One of the important differences between Chinese foreign aid management and traditional Western donor countries' aid management is the foreign aid management mechanism in the recipient country. The Western countries usually set up specialized assistance management institutions in the recipient country for the coordination of their aid activities in the country. China's foreign aid is under the leadership of the Ministry of Commerce. As it also undertakes other non-aid affairs, the Ministry of Commerce has not set up specialized foreign aid management agency. In the recipient country, therefore, China has not set up specialized institution for foreign aid management. The Overseas Economic & Commercial Office of the Ministry of Commerce is responsible for the coordination as well as the agricultural aid activity coordination and management in the recipient country. Its main functions include: 1) Project approval, understand the assistance needs of recipient countries through holding seminars or conducting research and form the initial project application. 2) Assist in signing project agreement, establish the contract and signing the implementation contract; 3) Coordinate the handover of the assistance projects; 4) Coordinate and organize the implementation work briefings of the project construction unit. In addition, for different aid projects, the Overseas Economic &



Commercial Office will provide different management services. Just like the Ministry of Commerce, the Overseas Economic & Commercial Office assumes many responsibilities and can hardly spare many staffs and a lot of time on the coordination and management of foreign aid affairs, so it is hard for the Overseas Economic & Commercial Office to play a role.

**Table 6 Role of the Overseas Economic & Commercial Office in the management of various agricultural aid projects**

Aid modalities	Management responsibilities of the Overseas Economic & Commercial Office
Construction phase of the agricultural technology demonstration centers	Demonstration center construction monitoring, helping resolve the difficulties in the process of project implementation and handling the intergovernmental transfers with relevant government departments of the recipient country
Technical cooperation stage of the agricultural technology demonstration centers	Management of the technical cooperation activities of the demonstration centers, especially the filing and registration of working staff as well as the briefing finishing
Dispatch of agricultural experts	Coordination of the technical services of agricultural experts
Agricultural material assistance	FAMP feasibility study, supplies supervision, exchanging the list of supplies
Agricultural technology training	Conduct research of the training needs of the recipient country, explore foreign aid training mode suitable for the recipient country and put forward specific suggestions, assist in student enrollment, assist relevant domestic department to order round-trip international airline tickets and conduct return visits to the trainees

Source: Based on various project management regulations of the Ministry of Commerce and the interviews with key informants of the Overseas Economic & Commercial Office in the Zimbabwe

#### **IV. Challenges for China's foreign aid**

Since the 1950s, China has been providing aid to other developing countries within its capacity and established its aid system and mode different from the traditional Western donors under the framework of South-South Cooperation, with an increasing influence in the field of international development. The "mutually beneficial and win-win situation in the South-South cooperation" advocated by China was recommended by Manning, former chairman of DAC as a goal of the Post-2015 Development Framework (Xu, 2013). In the construction of the new round of international discourse, China's voice has attracted unprecedented attention. China's foreign aid, however, is also facing challenges from the international community. Commentators have made thinly veiled criticisms of China's foreign aid as it does not obey the common aid rules established and followed by the



Western countries. Neo-colonialism, energy plunder and even land grabbing are often used in criticizing China. In fact, the Western countries' controversies about China's foreign aid, especially aid to Africa indicate that they are concerned that China's involvement in aid to Africa will become a challenge and even a threat for their traditional interests, including threats to democracy, human rights, good governance values and a variety of business rules imposed by the Western countries on Africa over time (Chris Alden, *China in Africa*, Zed Books & IAI, 2007, PP.102-110). China's foreign aid faces challenges from three aspects.

Firstly, in the face of rapidly growing scale of assistance, how can we improve the effectiveness and quality of aid? When the amount of aid is very limited, the province-based political mobilization method, the "turnkey" model and the aid method relying on the recipient countries' own ability, as adopted by China, can guarantee the quality of aid projects. The actual investment in aid project quality monitoring and evaluation is very limited, reducing the cost of China's aid. With the expansion of China's assistance scale, however, the lack of systematic and standardized aid quality monitoring and evaluation will become an increasing and prominent disadvantage. China is also going to learn from the experience of some development assistance projects of Western countries, but the high cost due to the implementation of the complex aid effectiveness monitoring system of the Western countries is also widely criticized. It will be the first challenge for China's foreign aid how to learn from the Western countries to improve the aid effectiveness monitoring and maintain "low cost" at the same time.

Secondly, facing the continuous development of the global multilateral cooperation framework, how can China better integrate into the multilateral development framework? Although China has established cooperative relationship with many international multilateral institutions, the cooperation mainly refers to the aid arrangements that those institutions have with China. In some cases, trust funds have been set up with a few agencies, but the number is very limited, and China's foreign aid is still mainly bilateral aid. Even the aid commitment to Africa under the multilateral mechanism of the Forum on China-Africa Cooperation is also realized through the bilateral mechanism. In the construction of the current international development system, China has also actively participated in the discussion of the Post-2015 Development Framework and even put forward and actively participated in the establishment of the BRIC Development Bank, the Asian Infrastructure Construction Bank and other multilateral mechanisms. For a long time, however, China has been absent in the multilateral cooperation mechanism. It is the second challenge as to whether China can understand quickly the international multilateral development discourse and its system and then participate and play its role in the system.





Thirdly, in the face of increasingly complex foreign aid affairs, how can China develop a professional team for development aid as soon as possible? For a long time, China's foreign development assistance relied on functional departments and project contracting agency's technical staff, not forming a foreign development assistance industry chain. The Western countries' development aid, however, has evolved its professional and specialized resources involving international political, economic, social, cultural, environmental and development programs, monitoring and evaluation as well as other different areas and aspects, laid the basis for academic training of foreign aid personnel and engaged effectively with think tanks. In China, there are now only a very small number of universities and research institutions that have set development aid-related curriculums and conducted the study of assistance that can have a dialogue with the Western discourse system. They will be hard pressed to provide intellectual support for China's foreign aid for the moment. On the one hand, China needs to learn from the experience of Western countries in training professional personnel and, on the other hand, it should consider how to avoid complete duplication of the Western method of "expert interventionism", which is the third challenge facing the development of China's foreign aid.

#### References:

1. Carol.Lancaster, "The Chinese Aid System", Center For Global Development Essay, 2007.
2. Carol.Lancaster, "Foreign Aid: Diplomacy, Development, Domestic politics", the University of Chicago Press, 2007b.
3. "China's African Policy", Xinhuanet, [http://news.xinhuanet.com/politics/2006-01/12/content\\_4042317.htm](http://news.xinhuanet.com/politics/2006-01/12/content_4042317.htm), January 12, 2006
4. Chris Alden, China in Africa, Zed Books& IAI, 2007.
5. Dai Lunzhang, editor in chief, "China's Foreign Economic Relations Towards the 21st Century", China Price Press, 1997
6. Deborah Bräutigam. "China's Challenge to the International Aid Architecture." *World Politics Review*, v. 1, n. 4 July/August 2009.
7. Deborah Brautigam, translated by Shen Xiaolei, Gao Mingxiu, "Dragon's Gift: The Real Story of China in Africa", Social Sciences Academic Press, 2012
8. Department of Aid to Foreign Countries, Ministry of Commerce, "Basic Situation of China's Foreign Aid",<http://yws.mofcom.gov.cn/article/m/policies/201205/20120508116616.shtml>, 2012-05-10



9. Dorothy McCormick, "China and India as Africa's New Donors: Understanding the Impact of Aid on Development." *Review of African Political Economy* 35(1):73-92, 2008.
10. Editor in chief, Shi Lin, "Contemporary China's Foreign Economic Cooperation", China Social Sciences Press, 1989
11. Huang Meibo, Renpei Qiang, "China's Foreign Aid: Policy Evolution and Future Trends", *International Economic Cooperation*, 2012, No. 3.
12. Liao Lan, Liu Jing, "Study of China's Foreign Aid in the Eye of the Western Countries", *Journal of China Agricultural University (Social Science)*, December 2012
13. Liu Zhongwei, "Comparative Analysis of African Development Aid among International Scale", "West-Asia and Africa", 2011.
14. Li Xiaoyun, Tang Lixia, Wu Jin, "Introduction to International Development Assistance", Social Sciences Academic Press, 2009.
15. Li Xiaoyun, "Can the Foreign Aid of China and the West Donors be Complementary in International Development?", unpublished, 2013.
16. Li Zhengping, Zhang Cuiwei, "Explore A New Way for Foreign Aid", *Economic Daily*, November 14, 1995
17. National Bureau of Statistics, "China Statistical Yearbook", 1950 -2013.
18. Ngaire Woods, "Whose aid? Whose influence? China, emerging donors and the silent revolution in development assistance", *International Affairs* (84: 6), 2008.
19. OECD, <http://stats.oecd.org/index.aspx>.
20. OECD Glossary of Statistics Terms, <http://stas.oecd.org/glossary/index.htm>.
21. The Chinese Ministry of Foreign Economic Relations and Trade, "Yearbook of China's Foreign Trade & Economic Cooperation (1994)", China Society Press, 1995
22. The Ministry of Commerce, "China's Foreign Aid" (White Paper), 2011
23. Wen Jiabao: "Comprehensively promote China-Africa new strategic partnership - Speech at the opening ceremony of the Fourth Ministerial Conference of FOCAC"
24. Xiaobing Wang, Adam Ozanne, "Two Approaches to Aid in Africa: China and the West", Prepared for the International Conference "Ten Years Of 'War Against Poverty': What Have We Learned Since 2000 And What Should We Do



2010-2020?” hosted by the Brooks World Poverty Institute, The University of Manchester, at Hulme Hall, 8-10 September 2010.

25. Xu Xiuli, If China can reconstruct the framework of international aid. Working paper, 2013
26. Zhang Qingmin, “From the ‘nationalism’ to the ‘mutual benefits’: the change to the policy of China’s foreign aid”, “Motherland”, 2010.
27. Zhang Xinghui, "China's Aid to Africa: Challenges for the EU?", quoted from the Door Mirrors, [UK] Benjamin • Barton, editor in chief, translated by Li Jingkun, "China and the European Union in Africa - African Factor in EU-China Relationship", Social Sciences Academic Press, 2011.
28. Zhang Yongpeng, "International Development Cooperation and Africa - Comparative Study of the Aid to Africa Provided by China and Western Countries", Social Sciences Academic Press, 2013.



# 中国的对外援助：历史、现状和挑战

马洁文 唐丽霞 李小云  
中国农业大学人文与发展学院

**摘要：**中国长期在致力于自身发展的同时，始终坚持向其他经济困难的发展中国家提供力所能及的援助，积极承担相应的国际义务。本文主要从中国对外援助的历史、政策、规模、方式、领域、流向、管理、经验与挑战等方面对中国对外援助进行了系统的介绍和梳理。中国的对外援助作为中国自身发展经验外部呈现的重要场域，积极支持了发展中国家的政治独立、经济发展和社会进步，也为实现我国不同时期的国际战略目标做出了重大的贡献，树立了“南南合作”的典范，并对西方传统援助架构进行了有益补充。同时，中国的对外援助还需要进一步提升援助政策智识水平，不断创新对外援助模式、优化援助结构，积极同西方国家展开有效对话，以应对日益升温的国际挑战。

**关键词：**对外援助 南南合作 互惠互利 共同发展

1950年，向越南和朝鲜提供物资援助拉开了中国对外援助的序幕，自此，中国一直在致力于自身发展的同时还始终坚持向其他发展中国家提供援助，从以政治外交目的导向的单边援助到追求经济效益的互惠合作，在南南合作框架下形成的中国对外援助模式和传统西方发达国家主导援助模式有着明显的差异（Wang & Ozanne, 2010），多种资金形式、多领域覆盖、多种援助方式和立体全方位的援助管理等构成了具有中国特色的援外模式。中国的对外援助项目获得了受援国普遍认可和赞誉，成为了对传统援助架构的有益补充（Li Xiaoyun, 2013），本文将对中国的对外援助体系进行系统的梳理和分析，并对与中国对外援助相关的讨论进行回应。

## 一、中国对外援助的历史和战略演变

国际社会在讨论援助领域中的中国时，经常使用“新的援助者”（emerging donor）来表明中国是对外援助体系中的“后起之秀”（Ngairé Woods, 2008; Dorothy McCormick, 2008），但实际上，中国几乎与西方国家同时开启了向其他发展中国家提供援助的序幕（Li Xiaoyun, 2013），从1950年中国向朝鲜和越南这两个国家提供物资援助开始计算，中国对外援助工作持续至今已有六十余年历史。根据中国对外援助发展变化的阶段性特征，大致将中国对外援助的发展历史划分为三个不同阶段。



第一阶段是新中国成立后到改革开放前，即中国对外援助的起步与初步发展阶段。1955年万隆亚非会议以后，中国对外援助的范围从周边国家扩展到其他发展中国家，尤其是非洲，援助方式以经济技术援助和军事援助为主，其中，坦赞铁路的建成成为中国对外援助的标志性事件。虽然中国政府于1964年宣布的以“平等互利，不附带条件”为核心的“中国对外经济技术援助八项原则”，但这一政策在此阶段还处于探索期，主要表现为援助的单向性特点突出，很少接受别国援助，援助更多是为了政治利益和外交利益（张清敏，2009年）。援助决策过于重视意识形态因素而欠缺经济可行性考虑，出现援助规模不成比例地急剧扩大，援助数额超出了中国的经济能力（李小云，2013），1971-1978年间一共向68个受援国提供了约296.6亿元援助，1972年达到了51亿元，占财政支出的6.7%，1973年达到了55.8亿元，占财政支出7.2%，超出世界上最发达、最富裕的国家对外经济援助的比例（张清敏，2009年）。

第二阶段是从20世纪70年代末至90年代中期，中国的对外援助进入了调整时期，在援助战略上更加突出了“平等互利”，对外援助的经济意义超越对政治利益的诉求，更加注重提高对外援助项目的经济效益和长远效果，力求同发展中国家形成互利双赢的共同发展模式。同时，随着国内从计划经济体制向社会主义市场经济体制转变过程的推进，援助的质量、效率和可持续性经济理性要素被逐渐纳入援外决策考量体系，另一方面，考虑到中国的经济实力和国内实际状况，“量力而行，尽力而为”成为该阶段援外的主要指导精神，对外援助金额并没有相应大幅增加，援外支出占国民生产总值（GNP）的比例仅为0.09%，并且由之前单一的援助国逐渐向“援助国-受援国”双重身份转，中国也开始接受援助。

90年代中期之后，随着中国经济实力的增强以及外交策略强调的“互利合作，共同发展”，中国作为一个非传统援助国的身份开始备受国际关注，中国的对外援助也由此进入了全面推进的第三阶段。首先，这一阶段中国对外援助的内容和方式实现了多样化，在援助渠道上重视在国际和地区层面加强与受援国的集体磋商，具体援助方式囊括了不同时期开发出的8种方式；其次，援助资金呈直线上升趋势，其中2004-2009年的对外援助资金平均年增长率为29.4%。从总体上看，机制化、制度化和规范化成为这一时期中国对外援助工作的重点。已经形成机制化的中非合作论坛成为中国向非洲提供经济技术援助的主要机制，论坛形成了系列行动文件成为中国对非洲提供援助的行动指南；2011年，中国发表了第一个《对外援助白皮书》标志着中国对外援助开始走向了公开化和透明化。由此，中国的援外体系的立体化和综合性特征日益凸显，并日渐成为中国符号的组成部分。此外，中国开始努力在国际上已经达成共识的框架体系内开展对外援助，积极参加联合国千年发展目标高级别会议并发表对发展中国家的援助承诺，并逐渐淡化了前期的受援国身份，越来



越多的双边和多边发展机构将其与中国单向援助关系转变为更加广泛的合作发展关系。

## 二、中国对外援助的资金、规模、方式、重点领域与流向

### 1、援助资金结构和规模

中国对外援助的资金主要包括三种类型，即无偿援助、无息贷款和优惠贷款，其中，无偿援助和无息贷款资金在国家财政项下支出，优惠贷款由中国政府指定中国进出口银行对外提供(商务部, 2011)，中国提供的优惠贷款年利率一般为 2%-3%，期限一般为 15 年至 20 年，此外，中国的援外相关资金还包括优惠买方信贷、中非发展基金和非洲中小企业发展专项贷款等。2010 和 2011 年两年，中国累计提供对外援助 633.6 亿元，其中赠款为 239.2 亿元，占到 37.75%；无息贷款为 97 亿元，占到 15.31%；优惠贷款总额为 297.4 亿元，占到 46.94%；同期，OECD-DAC 国家提供的官方发展援助总额为 2214.36 亿美元，其中赠款为 1813.36 亿美元，占到援助总额的 81.89%；优惠贷款仅为 361.89 亿美元，仅占到援助总额的 16.34%。

表 1 中国和 DAC 主要援助国的援助资金类型比较

	赠款		贷款		其他	
	额度	%	额度	%	额度	%
中国 (亿元)	239.2	37.75%	394.4	62.25%	-	-
DAC 成员国合计 (亿美元)	1813.36	81.89%	361.89	16.34%	39.11	1.77%

数据来源：中国数据来源于中国商务部，DAC 成员国数据来源于 <http://stats.oecd.org/index.aspx?>

中国并不向 OECD-DAC 汇报援助数据，援助的官方统计口径和 DAC 差异甚远（张兴慧，2011），如中国的债务减免、奖学金等均未列入官方发展援助的范畴；但西方援助统计则包括；再比如，中国的优惠贷款援助只计算其对于中国进出口银行的利息补贴，而不像 DAC 国家那样计算优惠贷款的全额；此外，中国的对外援助预算中通常还包括军事援助，以及为援助合资企业（foreign-aided joint venture）和合作项目所提供的贷款（Brautigam, 2009），显而易见，这些均未进入 ODA 的计算。因此，国际社会一直比较关注中国援助资金的规模，一些学者也进行了自己的估算，如有学者估计中国的发展援助每年要达到 15-20 亿美元（Lancaster, 2007b），但从规模上看，和发达国家相比，中国的援助额还比较小（刘中伟，2011 年）。





此外，对中国援助资金规模的关注也是因为国际援助两种角力平衡的变化，根据 DAC(2012)统计，2011 年所有 DAC 成员的 ODA 总额与 2010 年相比下降了 2.7%，其他官方资金流净支出额也比 2009 年下降了 50%，根据 DAC 的预测，这一下降趋势还将继续。而 2000 年以来，中国对外援助的资金总额却保持了快速增长，2004-2009 年平均年增长率为 29.4%，2012 年中国政府公布的援外资金是 2004 年的近三倍。另外，对中国援助规模的关注也源于中国对外援助承诺的高兑现率，根据 OECD/DAC 的统计数据，DAC 成员国的援助兑现承诺近年来都保持在 90%左右，而根据中国财政部中央财政支出预算和决算，中国的对外援助兑现程度达到了 95%以上，在一些年份决算数超过了预算数。

表 2 中国和西方国家对外援助的兑现程度

	2007	2008	2009	2010
DAC 总体	92.77%	86.63%	87.00%	90.25%
中国	103.40%	97.70%	95.70%	102.40%

数据来源：中国数据来源于《中国统计年鉴》，DAC 成员国数据来源于 <http://stats.oecd.org/index.aspx?>

## 2、援助方式

从对外援助的方式来看，中国的对外援助最早是从提供一般物资开始的，之后逐步增加了成套项目援助、技术合作、人力资源开发合作和援外医疗队，迄今为止，这五种传统的援助方式在中国对外援助中仍占有重要地位。20 世纪 90 年代以来，中国增加了紧急人道主义援助、援外志愿者和债务减免等新的援助方式，尤其是债务减免方面，中国政府的减债强度较为显著，截至 2011 年底，中国和 50 个国家签署免债议定书，免除到期债务 391 笔，金额达 275.6 亿元。

中国和 DAC 成员国都采取了技术合作、人力资源合作开发、援外医疗队、紧急人道主义援助、援外志愿者和债务减免等方式，并且都以项目援助为主。其区别在于，OECD-DAC 成员国还采取了预算支持和方案支持两种援助方式，这两种援助方式都会将援助资金直接提供给受援国/地区，由受援国/地区的相应部门来执行资金的使用，这部分资金比重大约占到援助总额的 20%；而中国的援助主要采取项目援助的方法，并且其援助工程项目主要是由中国公司来负责实施（Brautigam, 2011 年），很少援助资金直接转移到受援国/地区，这也就是常说的“交钥匙”工程。虽然在中国的官方文件中，没有预算援助和方案援助的提法，但是有研究者发现，中国实际上也会提供有限的预算援助，如 2004 年，中国向利比里亚提供 300 万美元用来支持分享权力的过渡政府运转 100 天，2006 年，中国又向其提供了 150 万美元的预算



支持，2004年，向几内亚比绍提供400万美元用于支付公务员工资，2007年向塞舌尔提供150万美元的国际收支支持，2009年向津巴布韦提供了500万美元的现金用来支付工资（Brautigam，2012）。中国政府提供的现金支持式的预算援助是非常零星的，具有很强临时性，不具有连续性和规范性，并且用途也是非常明确的，这和英国等国家倡导的预算援助有着明显的差异。

### 3、援助领域

按照官方统计口径，中国对外援助覆盖了农业、工业、经济基础设施、公共设施、教育、医疗卫生等领域以及新近提出的应对气候变化等，虽然中国对外公布的发展援助数据中并没有对各个投向的进行细分，很难获得详细的数据，但毋庸置疑的是，中国更多将援助资源投向西方不愿意投入到基础设施，但这却恰恰是很多发展中国家极需要的（Lancaster，2007年），中国在经济基础设施方面的支持力度是非常显著的，优惠贷款总额的61%和成套项目总数的20%都是投向于经济基础设施，西方发达国家则在此方面投入较少。西方发达国家的援助更多集中在社会公共基础设施和服务领域，2010年，流向该领域的资金占到了援助总额的30%，中国在此领域内的投入相对较少。和西方国家不同的是，中国比较重视在农业领域内的支持，中国农业援助方式非常多样，包括建设农场、农业技术示范中心、农业技术试验站和推广站，兴建农田水利工程，提供农机具、农产品加工设备和相关农用物资，派遣农业技术人员和高级农业专家传授农业生产技术和提供农业发展咨询，为受援国培训农业人才等，农业援助在中国对外优惠贷款中占到了4.7%，在成套项目个数中占到了10.62%，而西方发达国家对农业领域的援助相对较少。此外，中国很少向非政府组织提供发展援助，至今没有看到这方面的信息，而西方发达国家则比较重视促进非政府组织的发展，从2001年到2007年，西方发达国家向非政府机构提供援助额达到了1100万美元。

### 4、援助分布

从地区分布上来看，中国对外援助的地理分布比较均衡，受援国涉及亚非拉以及加勒比、大洋洲以及东欧等地区大部分发展中国家，截至2009年底，中国累计向161个国家以及30多个国际和区域组织提供了援助。从援助分布来看，中国和西方发展援助并没有明显的差异。从地理区域上来看，非洲和亚洲都是中国和西方发展援助的重点区域，中国更加重视对非洲的援助；中国对欧洲的援助很少，相比较而言，中国还更重视对拉丁美洲的援助。从受援国的经济发展条件来看，在中国和西方国家都将援助的重点全球最不发达国家，相比较而言，中国更倾向于向低收入国家提供援助，而西方则更加重视对低中等收入国家的援助。



表3 2009年中国和DAC成员国的援助区域流向比较

	欧洲	非洲	拉丁美洲	亚洲	大洋洲	未指明
中国	0.30%	45.70%	12.70%	32.80%	4%	4.50%
DAC 成员国合计	3.60%	31.62%	7.74%	32.64%	1.64%	22.76%
	全球最不发达国家	低收入国家	低中等收入国家	高收入国家	其他未指明	
中国	39.70%	23.40%	19.90%	11.00%	6%	
DAC 成员国合计	31.39%	12.61%	20.79%	6.04%	29.19%	

数据来源：商务部：《中国的对外援助》（白皮书），2011年；OECD网站：<http://stats.oecd.org/index.aspx?>

### 三、中国对外援助的机构与管理

随着对外关系和对外援助工作的发展，中国政府管理对外援助的各级机构逐步建立和健全，项目管理力度不断加强（商务部，2011），其特点可以概括为集中控制、统筹管理（张永蓬，2012）。虽然援助资金在快速增长，中国一直没有像西方国家以及一些主要的新型援助体建立起专门的独立机构来协调援助事务，援助事务统一归口到国务院协调，但国务院作为中国最高行政机关，是难以对对外援助事务进行细致协调和管理的，因此商务部则在对外援助管理中发挥着核心作用，负责拟定对外援助政策、规章、总体规划和年度计划，审批各类援外项目并对项目实施进行全过程管理（商务部，2011），需要管理和协调近90%的对外援助资金，除商务部外，外交部、财政部、农业部、卫生部等20多个政府部门都参与到了中国对外援助的管理中。因此，不同部门之间的协调一直是中国对外援助管理工作管理的重点，从早期的援外工作领导小组机制、部际联系机制到现在的部际协调机制都是不断的协调机制的创新。

商务部设立对外援助司来具体负责援助事务的管理，同时成立了三个业务机构来分别协助其援助管理工作，这三个机构分别为国际经济合作事务局、中国国际经济技术交流中心和商务部培训中心。商务部国际经济合作事务局主要负责援外成套项目和技术合作项目管理；商务部中国国际经济技术交流中心主要负责援外物资项目的实施管理；商务部培训中心承担援外培训的项目管理与综合协调职能。上述三部门在对外援助司的监督下，总体承担着援外项目执行过程的组织管理工作，包括招（议）标和项目实施的组织与管理。此外，卫生部负责医疗队、团中央负责海外



志愿者、外交部则负责紧急人道主义援助等，而优惠贷款则由中国进出口银行负责管理。此外，各个部委的国际合作部门都有一定的财政资金来开展本部门领域内的国际发展援助，从而造成了中国对外援助的碎片化，直接造成了援助统计上的困难以及援助管理成本的上升。

#### 四、中国对外援助面临的挑战

自上个世纪 50 年代以来，中国一直坚持给予其他发展中国家提供力所能及的援助，并且在南南合作框架下形成了不同于西方传统援助国的援助体系和模式，在国际发展领域中的影响日益增强，中国倡导的“南南合作中的互利共赢”也被前 DAC 主席 Manning 建议应该作为后 2015 发展框架目标 (Xu, 2013)，在当前新一轮国际话语体系构建中，中国的声音得到了前所未有的重视。但是，中国的对外援助也面临着来自国际社会的挑战。国际社会对没有遵循西方发达国家建立的并遵循的共同援助规则的中国援助“颇有微词”，新殖民主义、能源掠夺甚至土地攫取都是批评中国的常用语言。事实上，西方对中国的对外援助，尤其是对非援助争议背后体现的是其担心中国在非洲的参与会对西方传统利益构成挑战，甚至是威胁，这包括西方以殖民者身份长期对非洲施加的所谓民主、人权和良政价值观以及各种商业规则 (Chris Alden, *China in Africa*, Zed Books& IAI, 2007, PP.102-110)。中国对外援助面临着三个方面的挑战。

首先，面对不断快速增长的援助规模，如何提高援助的有效性和改善援助质量。在援助总量还十分有限的情况下，中国采取的以省包国政治动员方法、“交钥匙”模式以及主要依托受援国自身能力的方法能保证援助项目的质量，而实际用到援助项目的质量监控和评估上的投入非常低，这降低了中国援助的成本；但是随着中国援助规模的扩大，缺乏制度性和规范化的援助质量和效果监测评估的弊端将逐渐凸现，中国也在考虑借鉴西方发达国家发展援助项目的一些经验，但是西方国家由于复杂专业的援助有效性监控体系实施形成的高额成本也成为广为质疑的诟病之一。如何既要学习西方提高援助的有效性，又要保持中国对外援助的“低成本”特点将是中国对外援助的面临的第一个挑战。

其次，面对不断发展的全球多边合作框架，如何更好的融入国际多边发展框架。虽然中国已经和众多国际多边机构进行合作，但合作领域主要是这些机构的对华援助，中国也在多个机构设立了信托基金，但其数量十分有限，中国对外援助仍然是以双边援助为主，即便是在主导的中非合作论坛多边机制下，对非援助承诺也主要是通过双边机制来兑现。在当前国际发展体系构建中，中国虽然也积极参与 2015 发展框架的讨论，甚至也提出并积极开展金砖发展银行、亚洲基础设施建设银行等多边机制的建立，但是长期以来，中国在多边合作机制中的缺位严重，中国能否快速能够理解国际多边发展话语体系，参与其中并发挥作用是中国对外援助面临的第二



个挑战。

第三，面对日益复杂的对外援助事务，如何快速形成发展援助的专业人才队伍。中国的对外发展援助长期依赖职能部门和项目承建机构的技术人员，没有形成对外发展援助产业链条，不像西方国家发展援助已经形成了涉及到国际政治、经济、社会、文化、环境以及发展计划、监测和评价等不同领域和环节的职业化和专业化的产业，在援外人才队伍上已经形成了学科培养基础和智库支持，中国目前只有非常有限的几所高校和研究机构开设发展援助相关课程以及进行能够和西方话语体系对话的援助研究，还难以对中国对外援助提供智力支持。中国一方面要借鉴西方发达国家建设专业化援外人才的培养，一方面还要考虑如何避免完全重复西方“专家干预主义”的老路，这是中国对外援助发展面临的第三个挑战。

### 参考文献：

1. Deborah Brautigam 著，沈晓雷，高明秀译，《龙的礼物：中国在非洲的真实故事》，社会科学文献出版社，2012。
2. 戴伦彰主编，《走向 21 世纪的中国对外经济关系》，中国物价出版社，1997。
3. 国家统计局，《中国统计年鉴》，1950-2013。
4. 黄梅波，任培强，《中国对外援助：政策演变及未来趋势》，《国际经济合作》，2012 年第 3 期。
5. 廖兰，刘靖，《西方视野中的中国对外援助研究》，《中国农业大学学报（社会科学版）》，2012 年 12 月。
6. 李小云，唐丽霞，武晋，《国际发展援助概论》，社会科学文献出版社，2009。
7. 李争平，张翠微，《走出新的援外之路》，《经济日报》，1995 年 11 月 14 日。
8. 商务部援外司，“中国对外援助基本情况”，  
<http://yw.mofcom.gov.cn/article/m/policies/201205/20120508116616.shtml>，  
[2012-05-10](http://yw.mofcom.gov.cn/article/m/policies/201205/20120508116616.shtml)。
9. 商务部：《中国的对外援助》（白皮书），2011 年。
10. 石林主编，《当代中国的对外经济合作》，社会科学出版社，1989 年。
11. 温家宝：《全面推进中非新型战略伙伴关系——在中非合作论坛第四届部长级会议开幕式上的讲话》，  
新华网：[http://news.xinhuanet.com/world/2009-11/09/content\\_12413101.htm](http://news.xinhuanet.com/world/2009-11/09/content_12413101.htm)。
12. 《中国对非洲政策文件》，新华网，  
[http://news.xinhuanet.com/politics/2006-01/12/content\\_4042317.htm](http://news.xinhuanet.com/politics/2006-01/12/content_4042317.htm)，2006 年 1 月 12 日。





13. 张兴慧,《中国对非洲的援助:对欧盟的挑战?》,引自门镜,【英】本杰明·巴顿主编,李靖堃译,《中国、欧盟在非洲——欧中关系中的非洲因素》,社会科学文献出版社,2011年。
14. 张永蓬,《国际发展合作与非洲——中国与西方援助非洲比较研究》,社会科学文献出版社,2013。
15. 中国对外贸易经济部,《中国对外经济贸易年鉴(1994)》,中国社会出版社,1995。
16. Chris Alden, *China in Africa*, Zed Books& IAI, 2007.
17. Dreher A, Fuchs A. ,”Rogue Aid? The Determinants of China's Aid Allocation” JEL Classification: F35,October,2011.
18. Li Xiaoyun, “Can the Foreign Aid of China and the West Donors be Complementary in International Development?”, unpublished, 2013.
19. OECD, <http://stats.oecd.org/index.aspx>.
20. OECD Glossary of Statistics Terms, <http://stas.oecd.org/glossary/index.htm>.
21. Paulo S, Reisen H. Eastern Donors and Western Soft Law: Towards a DAC Donor Peer Review of China and India?”, *Development Policy Review*, 2010.
22. Penny Davis,”China and the end of poverty in Africa-towards mutual benefit?”, Published by Diakonia, August 2007.
23. Sachin Chaturvedi, Thomas Fues and Elizabeth Sidiropoulos,”Developing Cooperation and Emerging Powers”, Zed Books, 2012.
24. Sato J, Shiga H, Kobayashi T, Kondoh H, ”How do Emerging Donors Differ from Traditional Donors?-an Institutional Analysis of Foreign Aid in Cambodia”, Paper Prepared for the12<sup>th</sup> Annual Conference of GDN in Bogota, Columbia, January 15, 2011.
25. Thoma Lum,et al., ”China’s Activities in Africa, Latin America, and Southeast Asia”, Congressional Research Service, CRS Report for Congress, Feb.25,2009.
26. Vivien Foster, William Butterfield, Chuan Chen, and Nataliya Pushak, “Building Bridges: China’s Growing Role as Infrastructure Financier for Sub-Saharan African”, World Bank, Jul 2008.
27. Weston J, Campbell C, Koleski K, “China's Foreign Assistance in Review: Implications for the United States”, US-China Economic and Security Review Commission Staff Research Backgrounder, 2011.
28. William Lyakura, “American and Chinese Activities in Africa-and African Priorities for the Future”, Brenthurst Discussion Paper 6/2008, The Brenthurst Foundation.
29. Zhou Hong, ”China’s evolving aid landscape: crossing the river by feeling the stone”, 2012.





## 全球国际发展研究机构介绍 A Brief Introduction for CGD



2001年11月设于美国华盛顿的全球发展中心( Center for Global Development, 简称“CGD”)是一所具有敏锐洞察力的且独立运作的非营利性思想库,它主要运用囊括了政策分析以及创新性交流的具备顶尖水平的研究来将其思想付诸行动。该中心还旨在通过严谨的研究工作以及与政策社群(policy community)之间进行积极活跃的互动来减少全球贫困以及改善不平等现状,并最终致力于造就一个对所有人而言都更加繁荣、公正与安全的世界。CGD的主要创始人有三位,分别是 Edward W. Scott, Jr. C. Fred Bergsten 和 Nancy Birdsall (CGD 现任主席),他们在 CGD 创立之初的身份分别是技术型企业家、慈善家以及前美国政府高级官员。此外,CGD 现共有约 100 名横跨各个相关领域的专业研究人员。

CGD 围绕着“富裕国家的政策如何影响发展中国家人民”主题展开的研究涉猎广泛,主要遍布以下领域:援助的有效性、教育、全球化、健康、移民以及贸易,而对富裕国家制定发展政策方面提出的具体的、实践性改善的建议及其相关研究的核心在于“主动性”或者是“首创精神”方面。需要特别指出的是,该中心于 2003 年同《外交政策》杂志共同发布的“发展职责指数”(Commitment to Development Index, CDI, 也叫致力发展指数)引起了学界的广泛关注,其就富裕国家政策对发展中国家贫困人口产生的影响进行了定量研究,并用其来评估 21 个经济合作与发展组织(OECD)国家在“繁荣发展、和谐政府与安全”方面所取得的成就。CGD 希望通过这项评估活动推动发达国家对发展中国家的援助,这里的援助并不仅是给予更多的经济援助,还包括其他的 6 个方面,即贸易、投资、移民、环境、安全与技术。以这 7 个方面为评价指标,CGD 对 OECD 国家进行全面综合的评估,鼓励受评估国家进行其政策的改变与调整,以推动富裕国家为改善全球贫困、不平等以及环境现状做出贡献。

CGD 的研究小组依照不同的研究主题进行划分,每年保持在 4-5 个,包括国际发展协会的未来工作小组、非洲发展银行工作小组、国际贸易的优先权改革工作小组、国际货币基金组织项目与健康消费工作小组等等。与此同时,工作小组主持的项目成果包括:“聚焦于健康的优先设置:为更明智的公共消费建立制度(Priority-setting in Health: Building Institutions for Smarter Public Spending, 2012)”、“最贫困国家的自由市场(Open Markets for the Poorest Countries, 2010)”以及“世界银行在最贫困国家的工作进展:对新国际发展协会提出的 5 条建议(The World Bank's Work in the Poorest Countries: Five Recommendations for a New IDA)”等等。

更多详细信息,请参见网站: <http://www.cgdev.org/>